

ADDRESSING INEQUALITIES

The Heart of the Post-2015 Development Agenda and the Future We Want for All
Global Thematic Consultation

**ADDRESSING INTER-LINKAGES BETWEEN GENDER-
BASED VIOLENCE AND TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS
TO PREVENT REINFORCEMENT OF INEQUALITIES**

Jennifer Sorensen, Sara Piazzano, Olga DiPretoro, Carolyn O'Donnell

Winrock International

October 2012

Abstract

Acts of gender-based violence (GBV) – including social discrimination, harmful cultural practices and family violence – are committed throughout countries of varied cultural and religious traditions, political systems and socio-economic development. Trafficking in Persons (TIP), one of the worst forms of GBV, is often preceded and caused by the inferior position of women and girls in families, communities and societies. In countries where poverty rates are high and gender inequality is pervasive, GBV can lead to the abuse and isolation of women and girls and increase their vulnerability to being trafficked.

For more than two decades, Winrock International has worked with women and girls around the world to end TIP and GBV. Winrock's programs in Bangladesh, Belarus, Brazil, Cambodia, Kyrgyzstan, Moldova, Russia, Tajikistan, Ukraine and Uzbekistan demonstrate that women's access to information, livelihoods tools, life skills training and mentoring can empower them to make changes in their lives and rebuild their identities while promoting community understanding and protection of survivors and those at risk.

This analysis of the inter-linkages between GBV and TIP will concentrate on the importance of addressing gender-based and structural gender inequalities in counter-trafficking interventions to lessen women's vulnerability to trafficking, reduce community stigma toward survivors and increase effectiveness of survivor reintegration.

Biographies

Jennifer Cobb Sorensen is a gender expert with more than ten years of experience developing and managing programs around the world that promote gender equality and empower women and girls. Previously, as Program Officer at Winrock International, Ms. Sorensen led Winrock's human trafficking portfolio and contributed to the development of programs in the fields of girls' education, child labour prevention and civil society development. Ms. Sorensen holds a Master of Public Policy in International Policy and Development from Georgetown University and a Bachelor of Arts with Liberal Arts Honours in Government and English from the University of Texas at Austin.

Sara Piazzano is a seasoned development executive with ten years of experience implementing gender-related projects in India, Nepal, Sri Lanka and Bangladesh. During 2010-2012, she served as Chief of Party for Winrock International's Actions for Combating Trafficking-in-Persons initiative in Bangladesh. In this role, Ms. Piazzano provided essential support to develop and obtain approval for the first comprehensive anti-trafficking law in the country and the National Plan of Action to combat human trafficking. She now leads an anti-trafficking program in Cambodia. Ms. Piazzano holds a Master's degree in Development Studies and a degree in Languages and Culture of the Indian Subcontinent.

Olga DiPreto has designed and implemented initiatives addressing trafficking in persons and related issues on four continents while working with local and international NGOs, as well as a UN agency. Currently, as Program Officer at Winrock International, she oversees programs to combat modern day slavery and domestic violence and leads the development of new solutions to address these problems. Ms. DiPreto holds a Master's degree in International Policy Studies from Monterey Institute of International Studies and is originally from Ukraine.

Carolyn O'Donnell has worked on programs that empower women and girls for more than eight years, primarily as a monitoring and evaluation specialist. She currently manages the monitoring and evaluation for Winrock International's programs within the Empowerment and Civic Engagement Group, supporting data collection and management, research and evaluation in all program areas. As a Boren Fellow in Nepal from 2009-2010, she conducted research on a community-based family planning project with the Centre for Development and Population Activities (CEDPA). Ms. O'Donnell holds a Master's degree in International Development from American University, and a BA in Political Science and French from Grinnell College.

I. Introduction and Context for the Paper

Trafficking in persons (TIP) is a global phenomenon that is an attack on basic human rights, primarily of women and girls, across countries and cultures. Many forms of inequality are woven into what creates an enabling environment for TIP, including income disparities, location, ethnicity, age, sexual orientation, gender discrimination and gender-based violence (GBV). Notably, gender inequality and GBV are frequently cited as major contributing factors to TIP of women and girls.

For more than two decades, Winrock has implemented programs to prevent and address various forms of GBV, including domestic violence (DV) and TIP, across the world. Through its work in multiple countries on various forms of TIP, Winrock has concluded that the three P's of TIP (prevention, protection and prosecution) cannot be addressed effectively without also targeting the root causes of TIP, particularly GBV and gender inequality.

Winrock's programs target vulnerable populations and offer them access to information and resources to migrate safely, both within the country and across borders; training and mentoring for income-generation and small business development; and care and support for survivors of DV and TIP. Winrock also works with communities to raise awareness of trafficking and DV and to promote long-term, community-led initiatives that turn knowledge into concrete changes in attitudes and practices. Finally, Winrock's programs reach up to the regional and national levels, supporting government and civil society actors in effecting changes in laws, policies and practices related to gender inequality, GBV and TIP.

In its trafficking prevention programs, Winrock addresses trafficking of both men and women and provides tailored assistance to both groups while also addressing both genders in its prevention efforts. Winrock recognizes that gender discrimination and stereotypes affect men and women differently and there may be connections between gender norms and trafficking of men. However, this paper specifically focuses on GBV and trafficking of women. Further research is needed to explore factors that underlie and contribute to trafficking of men.

Winrock's global perspective provides it with a unique opportunity to highlight commonalities and draw lessons learned that can inform the UN's future efforts to address and prevent reinforcement of gender inequalities.

II. Addressing GBV and Structural Gender Inequalities as One of the Root Causes of TIP: Findings from Winrock Programs

TIP is a crime against women, men and children that takes many different forms depending on the country context. An enabling environment for TIP is created when a country is poor, has a weak rule of law and high rate of corruption, and lacks understanding of or respect for human rights and labor rights. The specific form that TIP takes in such an environment depends on the inequalities faced by its victims in the areas of income/wealth, location, ethnicity/minority status, age, sexual orientation and gender, including gender discrimination and GBV.

Over the past two decades, Winrock International has assessed the needs of TIP victims and those at high risk of being trafficked and worked to address the root causes that lead these groups to be trafficked. While Winrock works with both men and women to prevent and alleviate consequences of trafficking in persons, this paper focuses on GBV against women and trafficking of women. Additional research initiatives are needed to assess potential causal links between male trafficking and gender norms and male stereotypes.

As part of the development and monitoring of these programs, Winrock has repeatedly seen that women and girls who have been victims of gender-based violence and live in societies that tolerate severe gender discrimination appear to be more vulnerable to becoming victims of TIP. Below are some regional and country-specific highlights of the intersections of GBV and TIP in Winrock's programs.

ASIA

In South Asia, women and girls are faced with multiple forms of GBV on a regular basis. These include public pestering (often accompanied by isolation), domestic violence, forced and child marriage, stigmatization of victims of sexual violence and marginalization of divorced women. Extreme forms of GBV in the region include acid throwing and bride burning.

In Bangladesh, public sexual harassment and molestation (previously referred to as "Eve teasing") is a growing problem, forcing young women to live secluded lives to avoid public humiliation, thereby interrupting their access to information and education. Public sexual harassment can also lead to early marriage: families marry off their daughters to prevent the risk of their molestation and rejection by the community. Families prefer to put daughters under the "protection" of a husband even if she runs the risk of being abused by him or his extended family. In early marriages, girls are often subjected to domestic violence and early pregnancies that can lead to severe health complications, both for the mother and the child, including death. Young brides can end up living in a slavery-like situation with no chance to be rescued. Even a divorce can worsen the situation of a girl who is not economically independent,

who has few chances to remarry, and who the family will not take back. In Bangladesh, Winrock has recorded many cases of girls who have run away from forced/early marriage and domestic violence, are taken advantage of by traffickers and end up in exploitative situations.

Dowry, another form of GBV, is a push factor in countries such as Bangladesh. The value of the girl decreases with age; thus, the dowry payment the daughter's family must make to the husband's family is lower when the girl is young. As a result, family members (particularly males) will emotionally torment girls if they remain unmarried even at the young age of 16 or 17. The harassment can reach the point where girls feel they have no other choice but to run away from home without any means or skills to survive on their own, which leaves them vulnerable to trafficking. Another common way to traffic girls in these countries is to promise the family a marriage without a dowry to convince them to leave their young girls with traffickers.

Married girls and young women can also become vulnerable to TIP if they lose their husbands, either to divorce or death. These women have difficulties finding a job and are seen as a burden by their families since it is difficult for the women to remarry, especially when they have young children and especially if these children are girls. Women are also afraid that in a second marriage, the husband will discriminate against or even refuse to support the children they had in their previous marriage. Again, a marriage arranged in a hurry can be an easy way to cheat the family and traffic the girl. Another risk is that these young women will be forced to migrate for work, and if they do not have access to the right information and legal channels, they can become victims of TIP.

Even when marriage is not an explicit factor, rural families in countries such as Bangladesh who need additional income will sell or send off their children to be domestic workers with distant relatives or acquaintances in urban areas. These girls (and boys, to a lesser extent) are frequently put in extremely exploitative situations in which they are physically, sexually and psychologically abused by their host families. Some are sold to traffickers, while others run away and are ensnared by the same system of traffickers.

Nargis's husband was a poor day laborer in Bangladesh. Unsatisfied with his life and eager for money, he beat and insulted Nargis, whom he had married without a dowry from her father. After trying unsuccessfully to obtain money from his in-laws, he sent Nargis to India, convincing her that she would have a better life in the new country.

But on the way to India, Nargis was sold to a man who kept her locked in a house and tortured and raped her. One day Nargis was able to get to a phone and called her mother, who immediately came and released her from captivity by paying a large amount of money to the broker. Nargis then returned to her hometown with her mother.

Nargis learned about a nearby shelter home and went to live there. After an in-depth assessment, she received counseling and psychological support, which helped her regain her self-confidence. She also completed a small trades training. Now Nargis is back home running a small grocery shop and feels confident while she walks around the village, dreaming of a better future (Winrock International, 2010).

Similarly, in Cambodia, poor families often see girls as a good source of income. The family (in many cases the mother) sells her daughter to a trafficker knowing she will be forced to work as a prostitute. In many cases young girls decide to sell themselves to support their families and in some cases traffickers convince girls that it is their duty to do so. To combat this phenomenon, civil society organizations (working in partnership with the government) have led a model over the past decade to carry out raids on brothels and other venues where sex is sold and to “rescue” victims of TIP and refer them to safe shelter or help them return to their community and/or family. In the last couple of years, however, practice of this method has decreased. It has been criticized for its ineffectiveness and, together with new laws, for driving prostitution underground, thus contributing to further isolation of victims.

Sold for 2 kg of rice

Dilen was a young girl living in the province of Kokong in Cambodia. Her poor family was approached by a man who showed them a leaflet of a recruiting agency and offered them to bring their daughter to Malaysia to work as domestic worker. He did not ask for money and offered them 2 kg of rice. The family was happy and Dilen was proud to be able to help them. The last time parents saw their daughter was at the airport. They never heard from her again and no NGOs or authorities were able to help them find her. The parents still have hope that she is alive and will come back one day.

In addition, integration and re-integration programs for TIP victims in Cambodia have lacked sufficient resources to provide effective support to victims. As noted, it is common for families to send their girl children to work, to be complicit in their sexual exploitation, or to be too unstable to care for the child in the first place. Despite this reality, until recently, little work has been done to assess and counsel the survivors’ families, so it was not uncommon to see TIP survivors being returned to the same vulnerable situation that led them to being trafficked in the first place – in many cases to an even more unstable situation, since family culpability and community rejection can be high for a survivor of trafficking (Mauny & Srun, forthcoming).

Rape in societies such as Bangladesh and Cambodia can be especially devastating for the victim, especially given that perpetrators rarely are punished. Girls who have been raped are rejected by their communities as a “polluting element” and further abused and publicly humiliated. Families often accept any proposals to send these girls away, even knowing they will probably end up in forced prostitution, to rid themselves of the shame the rape has brought to their families. In many parts of Asia and Africa, where the HIV infection rate is high, people believe that raping a virgin will make them stronger and will heal them of various diseases, including AIDS. In some cases young girls are also convinced to sell their virginity to help their families and end up being trapped in the sex trade, too young and helpless to find a way to escape.

EUROPE AND EURASIA

In former Soviet countries such as Russia, Moldova and Ukraine, the breakdown of the socialist state continues to have long-term negative consequences for its citizens, particularly women. In Moldova, nearly a quarter of the population is estimated to live abroad, leaving generations of children abandoned or orphaned to the state (World Bank, 2011). Despite protective systems, many children left behind are affected emotionally and sometimes under-protected by their guardians and inadequately supervised. In general, they receive little or no physical or emotional nurturing from their caregivers. Very often, children experience a sense of abandonment, lose their self-esteem and are vulnerable to abuse or violence, especially to the enticements of traffickers (United Nations Children’s Fund [UNICEF], 2008).

A recent survey conducted by the Ministry of Statistics in collaboration with the United Nations in Moldova found that 7 out of 10 women in rural areas and 6 out of 10 women in urban areas experience spousal/partner violence at least once in their lifetime; 12% of all women in Moldova have experienced all types of violence (psychological, economic, physical and sexual) (United Nations Development Programme [UNDP], 2011). Combined with high alcoholism and drug abuse rates and a lack of shelters or other support for abused women, conditions in Moldova have pushed a high number of women to accept risky or suspect job prospects abroad in order to escape their circumstances.

The former Soviet country of the Kyrgyz Republic presents an additional form of GBV – bride stealing (*ala kachuu*) – that has widespread negative ramifications for young women in that country. During *ala kachuu*, a girl is abducted, raped, and then declared the wife of her assailant. In some cases the “stealing” more closely resembles an arranged elopement, but in the majority of cases the abduction is non-consensual. The assailants are rarely prosecuted and the girls/women are forced by their families to accept the marriage, since they are no longer “pure” and no one else will want to marry them. Because of the fear of *ala kachuu*, particularly in rural areas, post-pubescent girls live in increasing seclusion as they get older, leading to lower education levels and isolation from society. Girls who do not accept their marriages are often rejected by their families and left with few options due to the stigma from sexual abuse (Lom, 2004). With few other options, many turn to prostitution and seek risky work abroad, often falling into traffickers’ nets.

“If a woman wants to leave a violent relationship or household she has to start from scratch. She has to change everything, including where she lives and where she works. This is why women are so attracted by ads for jobs in other countries. They are often desperate to get out and go somewhere new. If you tell them that they are likely to be forced into prostitution they say “well, better to be a prostitute there than to be raped and abused by my husband.”
-Ukrainian NGO worker (Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights, 2000b)

Sexual assault is another form of GBV that directly contributes to TIP. In the 1990's and early 2000's, women and girls in the Former Soviet Union faced higher levels of violence and harsh economic conditions. At the same time, romanticized views of "easy money" to be had abroad, as well as pressure and coercion from parents, colleagues, friends and acquaintances, encouraged women to migrate. For victims of DV, "especially women from families with conflict, mainly children and orphans," the option to escape their current violent situations was too attractive to pass up (Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights, 2000b). Women who travelled abroad hid stories of abuse and violence because of the stigma they would encounter. In some cases they even became complicit in the act of trafficking, luring acquaintances and family into TIP situations in order to profit themselves.

LATIN AMERICA

In Brazil, Afro-Brazilian girls and young women are a vulnerable and targeted group for commercial sexual exploitation, especially in the northeastern state of Bahia de Salvador. In addition to being a tourist attraction, Salvador, the capital of Bahia, has been shown to have a high incidence of sexual violence against children and adolescents, with record cases of child sex tourism reported. The area also has a large minority population, a high level of poverty and income inequality.

In a study conducted by Winrock in 2008, the majority of girls interviewed (all TIP victims between the ages of 12 and 18) reported having been victims of physical or sexual abuse before becoming involved in commercial sexual exploitation, some as early as 8 years of age. Faced with violence at home and raised in a culture that treats women primarily as sex objects, these young girls abandoned their families and fled to urban centres in Bahia. Some went on to destinations abroad, seeking recognition and better lives, and became involved in sex work. The majority of these girls migrated without an understanding of the risks they were taking, or without hope for an alternative, primarily, the ability to lead an economically independent life free from violence in their home town (Winrock International, 2008c).

III. Lessons learned and sustainable strategies to address inter-linkages with GBV in trafficking programs

Winrock's programs addressing GBV and TIP have demonstrated that women's access to information, livelihoods tools, life skills training, and mentoring, coupled with public sensitization and policy change, can empower women to make changes in their lives and rebuild their identities, simultaneously promoting community understanding and protection of survivors and those at risk. Addressing TIP with a focus on GBV as a root cause involves implementing integrated activities in three areas: prevention, protection and policy/prosecution.

A. PREVENTION

1. Public awareness campaigns. Proper messaging in public awareness campaigns is an extremely important component in TIP programming. In Bangladesh and Russia, past anti-TIP campaigns may have contributed to GBV rather than combating it due to messages that scared, rather than informed, women of the risks of trafficking. Posters that depict traffickers kidnapping and beating women, and messages such as "Let's Protect our Women," "Women, Do Not Fall for Promises," "Women Migrating to India End Up in Brothels," "Do Not Trust Anyone Offering a Job to a Woman – He is a Trafficker," and "While You are Reading This, another Woman has become Enslaved" perpetuate the stereotype that women cannot migrate safely, which results in higher seclusion and marginalization of women looking for a way out. In addition, campaigns that have insisted on the mistakes committed by women that have led to trafficking have reinforced the idea that women are guilty. A campaign in Bangladesh on compulsory HIV testing for the victims of human trafficking reinforced the negative attitude towards victims as a polluting element in their communities (S. Piazzano, interview, August 15, 2012).

One of the main barriers to reintegrating survivors in their communities is the social stigma and discrimination they face once they return home. In Bangladesh a belief is prevalent that women who travel abroad for work go with the understanding that it might be for sex work, while migration of males for work is considered more legitimate. Thus, when women return from work overseas, there is a stigma that they were involved in sex work, no matter what their actual circumstances were. To combat this issue, Winrock developed an awareness campaign with a special focus on reintegration – a campaign from the point of view of survivors that portrays them as winners who have defeated trafficking, and the community as the needed support to facilitate their reintegration. A new campaign logo and slogan – "Let's Fight Together Against Human Trafficking" – were developed with essential input from survivors of human trafficking. Additional messages identified for the campaign were: "Safe migration can lead you to a better future; check all the necessary papers yourself," "What do you understand of the suffering of a survivor of human trafficking?" and "People who have survived trafficking are now fighting against it; are you with them?" (Winrock International, 2012).

Another important element to include in anti-TIP campaigns is information on sexual harassment and early marriage. Changing attitudes and practices regarding child marriage, dowry and sexual harassment, especially in schools, would lessen the isolation of young women and allow them to complete their education and access information about livelihoods opportunities, including safe migration options. In Bangladesh, Winrock initiated adolescent group meetings to discuss topics of importance and interest to youth: employment prospects, health and relations between genders.

2. Empowerment through Information and Education. In Russia and Moldova, Winrock's anti-TIP programs include information and training on domestic violence for teachers and young people in educational settings. The focus is on vulnerable and at-risk populations such as adolescents in orphanages (*internats*) and technical schools. Trainings include the cycle of DV, information on healthy relationships, life skills and human rights. In Russia, Winrock supported after-school groups that brought boys and girls together to discuss sex and respectful interpersonal relations as well as information on safe migration. In Moldova, Winrock developed a *Destinies and Destinations* radio and television program to improve television, radio and print media coverage of trafficking in persons and related issues. Each episode examined a topic related to TIP and its prevention, including safe migration practices, alternatives to working abroad and economic opportunities for women in

Moldova. Each monthly television broadcast on Moldova One (national broadcast channel) is estimated to have reached more than 100,000 viewers across the country, with additional viewers in Europe and the Middle East watching the program on the Moldova International satellite channel (Winrock International, 2008a).

In Bangladesh, where seclusion of women and girls is also a cause of TIP (restricting access to information on job offers and/or leading girls to hide their intentions to leave), Winrock has organized life skills training programs to empower young women to make better decisions for their future and help them develop interpersonal skills to relate to men on a more equal ground. Question boxes were introduced in schools to give adolescents the option to find support when they face difficult situations.

In 2011 and 2012, Winrock introduced Information, Education and Communication (IEC) materials in Bangladesh with new images of poor but street-smart women, empowered and standing up for their own rights. The materials (such as posters, a TV spot and comic books) portray female survivors who proudly fight for their right to restart their lives, bravely overcoming challenges and committed to the fight against human trafficking. The materials also show female survivors working as peer promoters/key informants in the community, as well as female workers migrating safely internally and to other countries by following the right process and being well informed. The IEC materials provide valuable information on available services

Sample topics covered by Destinies & Destinations TV and radio programs:

- Profiles of female role models, successful professional women (academics and scientists) as well as women who started new businesses with Winrock assistance
- Examination of women in local advertising
- Moldovan media coverage of TIP
- Portrayal of village life in Moldova and how those left in the villages – almost exclusively youth and the elderly – have been affected by economic changes and outward migration
- Opportunities for Summer Work and Travel programs in the U.S. and useful information on “Know your rights!” a campaign for students intending to participate in this program (Winrock International, 2008b)

Elena G., a young woman from Moldova, found herself in a difficult situation after the birth of her child: her husband became impatient and aggressive. He criticized her for her cooking and cleaning and started coming home drunk. Elena felt guilty and questioned her abilities as a wife. With time, the abuse worsened and Elena was often humiliated in front of his friends and family; however, they told her to tolerate it because that's how men are. Her husband often apologized, but the abuse didn't end. Elena continued living in an abusive situation hoping her husband would change.

Finally, her love for her son and desire to protect him from a negative upbringing pushed her to leave. With no means to survive, she took an illegal job in Russia and left her child with her parents. She couldn't bear separation and came back. It was then she learned about Winrock's services for domestic violence survivors. She received psychological counseling and enrolled in entrepreneurship courses and finally opened a small clothing shop. She is now confident in herself and her ability to provide for her child.

and contacts for women seeking to migrate, with positive messages on reintegration to raise communities' commitment to supporting the reintegration of survivors of trafficking and to fight stigmatization and discrimination (Winrock International, 2012).

3. Income generation and education. Recognizing that economic instability is an important root cause of TIP and GBV, Winrock's anti-TIP and DV programs offer skills training and educational support for girls and women, seed support, microfinance programs, entrepreneurship training and mentorships to give victims of TIP and DV as well as other vulnerable groups of women increased chances to be economically independent. For example, programs implemented in Moldova and the breakaway republic of Transnistria offered a range of trainings, including one-day job readiness trainings, short-term "Could I be an Entrepreneur?" trainings, long-term entrepreneurship courses, specialty follow-up

business trainings, and support to improve Moldova's vocational education system.

Complementary programs were also developed to provide seed money through grants and loans, give vulnerable groups access to credit at banking institutions, and mentorships with successful entrepreneurs (Winrock International, 2008a).

In addition, an annual Summer School of Leadership (organized in cooperation with OSCE/Moldova and Peace Corps Moldova) brings 50 young women from all over Moldova together for one week to develop their leadership and entrepreneurship skills while addressing domestic violence and trafficking risks. Summer School of Leadership courses focus on self-confidence, risks of domestic violence and trafficking, knowledge of educational and job opportunities, skills needed to enter the labor market, basics of business start-up and protection against commercial sexual exploitation. As a result of the School, the young women become leaders in their community and spearhead efforts to prevent violence and promote employment opportunities throughout communities (Winrock International, 2011b).

B. PROTECTION

1. Shelter homes and community-based care. Winrock has found that most shelters with which it has partnered in project countries assist victims of both TIP and DV. As noted above, in many cases, shelter home workers report that the majority of TIP victims had some other experience of GBV prior to being trafficked. Support services that are typically provided in these shelters include some or all of the following:

- Safe accommodation (shelter, foster care, community care)
- Food and clothing
- Emergency health care and/or first aid
- Legal support, representation and information
- Safety planning
- Psycho-social support and/or therapy
- Life skills
- Literacy & basic education
- Vocational training
- Income generation
- Reintegration support
- Connection with local resources

Shelter homes offer security and full-time care that is often necessary for TIP and GBV victims who are recovering from extreme trauma or have violent home environments that do not allow their immediate return. Care and support needs are also similar for these two populations, though the security needs of TIP victims can be more drastic, which can lead to tensions and have the effect of limiting the movement of all shelter users. Severe restrictions on the freedom of shelter residents can hamper reintegration and lead to feelings of isolation and despair (Mauny & Srun, 2012).

To address this issue, Winrock has taken steps in several countries to offer different models of care suited to the circumstances of individual survivors. In Ukraine, Winrock offered drop-in services at its Women for Women centres in each region. These centres provided job skills training, psycho-social support, information on trafficking and domestic violence prevention, and legal assistance, primarily for young women between the ages of 12 and 40 (Rudd, 2001). In Bangladesh, Winrock supports pilot transit centres in areas that have high migration flows and numerous recorded instances of trafficking for labour and sexual exploitation. These transit centres aim to cover gaps in shelter services while promoting a more flexible approach to services aimed at reintegration in the community. Survivors usually stay at transit centres for no more than four days. During that time, Winrock assesses survivors' needs to expedite the

reintegration process. When either the survivor or community is not ready for reintegration, the survivor is transferred to a nearby shelter home (Winrock International, 2012).

In addition to providing direct support to GBV and TIP victims, Winrock's programs offer training and sensitization to psychologists and social workers, who are frequently under-qualified and untrained and may themselves harbour biases against the women and girls in their care. In some cases, social workers have urged women to forget their experience and hide their past, leaving victims with unresolved feelings of shame and grief and the fear that their past might be uncovered. Intensive work with all staff of NGOs dealing with survivors of GBV and TIP is needed to develop respect for survivors and a needs-based support system.

2. Rehabilitation and integration/reintegration.

Current approaches to integration/reintegration and rehabilitation of survivors sometime reinforce gender discrimination practices and lead to re-trafficking. For example, in Bangladesh, programs that have proposed marriage as a strategy for reintegration spread the idea that to marry a victim of trafficking is an act of piety, condemning these women to live with men that do not respect them. In addition, spreading the idea that the only way to survive for the victims is to marry risks pushing families to arrange marriages in a hurry, with all of the negative consequences that it entails (S. Piazzano, interview, August 15, 2012).

Winrock offers a variety of support to survivors of TIP in Bangladesh, including livelihoods training and small business grants. In a recent case in Bangladesh, Winrock provided training and seed money for a survivor to rent and stock a small shop in her village. However, her father and brother quickly ended up taking over the shop, leaving the woman no better off than she had been. Winrock has seen that it is fairly common for male family members, especially elders, to interfere with efforts to help women gain independence. Winrock works to combat this phenomenon with on-site visits and follow-up phone calls for a minimum of one year after reintegration.

As a result of its follow-up with this survivor, Winrock provided additional training and guidance to the woman, and after three months, she was able to take back her shop and gain independence from her father and brother (Winrock International, date).

While community-based care is the best option for many victims of GBV and TIP, it can be difficult to provide qualitative services at the local level and to track this assistance. In some countries, such as Moldova, the development of a national TIP referral system has had a positive impact. Local resource organizations throughout Moldova are able to refer victims of trafficking to regional focal points throughout the country, increasing the number and quality of both incoming and outgoing referrals and helping to enhance service provision for vulnerable women (Winrock International, 2008a).

All of Winrock's programs promote community understanding and protection of survivors and those at-risk through a variety of culturally appropriate methods such as drama/street theatre, community orientations and development of support groups to support the reintegration process (especially of female survivors). On an individual level, Winrock supports a number of

peer-to-peer efforts, including the development of adolescent groups and peer promoters in schools to act as key informants on trafficking and safe migration, as well as female survivors working as peer promoters/key informants in the community).

Acknowledging that attitudes and behaviours cannot be changed overnight, Winrock also works with elders and respected leaders in communities to spread messages within the community that ease the integration of survivors and community acceptance. For example, in Bangladesh, one elder Imam helped a female victim of trafficking reintegrate by explaining that the woman had gone overseas for “training” and was now back in the community to help others. This gave the woman the opportunity to reintegrate without the stigma of being a TIP victim, allowing her to choose when to come forward with her story in her own time.

C. POLICY/PROSECUTION

1. National and regional level policies and practices. Complementing interventions at the individual and community levels, actions must be taken to create and/or strengthen country laws and policies related to TIP and GBV in order to change the enabling environment that allows these crimes to take place.

In Bangladesh, Winrock supported formation by survivors of “Survivors’ Voice” groups named ANIRBAN (“the flame that will not fade”). The groups serve as advocates to address protection issues at the community level and as mentors in developing and providing services to other survivors. During the past year and a half, ANIRBAN groups have taken the lead in building their own self-confidence and group identity, raising awareness about human trafficking, advocating for survivors’ rights, and giving voice to survivor concerns in communities. They are facilitating sessions in schools and madrassas on safe migration; conducting interactive meetings with journalists and local government; and promoting human rights and women’s rights in their communities. In July 2012, the groups convened a Survivors’ Convention, at which approximately 100 survivors from around the country shared their concerns and expectations. Attendees created a document to be presented to policy makers, civil leaders, program planners/managers, media, legal experts, and service providers, including communities. It includes demands for rights relating to survivor-friendly prosecution, psycho-social empowerment, and integrated and standardized services for survivors.

In Brazil, Winrock provided management and technical assistance that contributed to the creation of the *State Committee on Prevention and Combating Trafficking in Persons in Bahia* in December 2007, as well as the development and publication of Bahia’s State Plan to Combat Trafficking in Persons in 2011. This is the first state-level, anti-trafficking policy to be published after Brazil’s National Anti-Trafficking Policy was rolled out in 2006, making the State of Bahia a model for the other Brazilian states. Winrock was also an active member of the *Bahia State Committee to Fight Sexual Violence against Children*, and successfully advocated to include two youth from its program in this group, providing the committee with the unique experiences and perspectives of TIP survivors (Winrock International, 2011a).

In Moldova, Winrock worked to create a referral system among its Regional Support Centers and was also an active participant in the piloting and creation of a National Referral System. Regional focal points appointed by the Ministry of Social Protection, Family and Child coordinated multi-disciplinary teams of specialists to provide multilateral reintegration assistance to victims of trafficking, while a National Coordination Centre collected, processed, analysed and referred case data. Winrock also developed and distributed a Referral Guide to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of the professional referral systems in place at both MATI's Regional Support Centres and at other anti-trafficking actors in Moldova. With the help of this referral system, local organizations increased the number and quality of both incoming and outgoing referrals, increased the range of their local partners, and enhanced their reputation as reliable service providers for vulnerable women (Winrock International, 2008a).

As a lead organization in Bangladesh providing technical support to the government in the development of a National Plan of Action (NPA) for 2012-2014, Winrock made it a priority to include gender-sensitive language in the NPA. For the first time in a government document, discriminatory definitions such as "destitute women" and "vulnerable/divorced/unmarried women" are omitted, and instead terms like "single women" and "single women with children" have been introduced. The NPA and the new law insist on the right for men and women to be informed and empowered to migrate safely. The two documents overcome the previous approach, which aimed to inform men but to protect women and children as passive actors.

2. Prosecution. In many countries, police are challenged in properly identifying victims of TIP and GBV and unsure how to apply TIP and GBV-related laws. At worst, some police are even complicit in these crimes. However, training and networking with police is necessary to both increase the prosecution of traffickers as well as properly identify and refer victims of trafficking and GBV to the care and support they need.

In the Russian Far East, Winrock provided ongoing technical assistance to the judicial and criminal justice systems for reform and effective implementation of Russia's laws in accordance with international standards on TIP. Winrock conducted training for specialists from law enforcement on the roots and scope of the problem of human trafficking, methods of administering professional assistance to victims, techniques for providing psychosocial and support to victims, and the legal framework of anti-trafficking efforts. Winrock also developed and published a manual on *Human Trafficking: Classification and Law-enforcement Issues*, a practical study guide for law enforcement officials. The manual touches upon important issues of human trafficking classification and law enforcement, including the criminal-adjudicatory characteristics of human trafficking, the problem of delimitation of human trafficking from combined crimes (including GBV), typical law-enforcement mistakes arising from the human trafficking classification, and guidance on laws to be enforced in such cases (Winrock, 2010).

In Bangladesh, Winrock conducts two-day mixed stakeholder trainings for law enforcement personnel as well as public prosecutors, lawyers, paralegals and staff of NGOs on the concepts of human trafficking, domestic and international laws, interaction with survivors, victim identification and referral mechanisms. The mixed trainings were designed to enhance coordination and synergy among the different stakeholders within the target localities. The expected output, apart from improved knowledge on the issue, is increased sharing and understanding of each stakeholder's challenges in order to improve communication and collaboration. A lesson learned is that the initial TIP trainings work well in a mixed group, but more specialized follow-up trainings for the separate professional groups would help improve the skills and knowledge that participants need for their specific roles. To address this issue, Winrock has begun to plan separate specialized sessions for law enforcement, public prosecutors, lawyers/paralegals and NGO staff (Winrock International, 2012).

IV. Conclusions and recommendations

First and foremost, efforts to address GBV must be woven into all aspects of anti-TIP programs in order for them to be effective and sustainable. TIP prevention programs must not only raise awareness of TIP but must also address attitudes and practices that tolerate and even encourage acts of GBV in societies that are major source areas for victims of TIP. National policy efforts to fight TIP need to include initiatives to make laws gender-sensitive and empowering for women and girls. TIP protection programs should look at the impact of past instances of GBV on TIP victims and use this information in developing integration/re-integration plans; GBV and domestic violence programs should treat their victims as high-risk for TIP and include info on TIP and safe migration in their interventions.

Recommendations:

PREVENTION
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Ensure that TIP public campaign messages are positive, empowering, action-based and informative and do not unintentionally reinforce gender discrimination practices, lead to re-victimization of TIP victims and/or perpetuate stigma• Ensure that anti-TIP campaigns are always supported with information on safe domestic and cross-border migration, especially for women• Develop and distribute IEC materials that provide valuable information on available services and contacts for women seeking information to migrate, as well as positive messages on reintegration to raise communities' commitment to become active supporters in the reintegration of survivors of TIP and to fight stigmatization and discrimination

- Increase efforts to work with adolescent groups (boys and girls together) to discuss sex, sexual harassment and early marriage, and work with them to develop respect for women and increase empowerment of girls and boys
- Accelerate prevention programming to fight gender discrimination and violence, including sexual harassment
- Integrate economic empowerment activities in all prevention measures to ensure that the key root cause is addressed
- Support programming to discuss how the media portray women and girls as sexual objects and work with students to develop respect for women and condemn GBV and TIP
- Give survivors a voice: train and empower them to advocate for better services, participate in public forums and campaigns, and work as peer promoters in communities to change attitudes and increase acceptance of survivors.

PROTECTION

- Develop/revise case management systems to include the collection of GBV data in TIP programs
- Offer comprehensive, well-rounded services that provide girls and women with tools they need to become economically independent, make better decisions for their future and relate to men on more equal ground
- Assess push factors in each particular situation, which may include family violence, and address them during reintegration to prevent re-victimization, including through family counselling
- Lead community orientations and support groups to support the reintegration process, especially of female survivors
- Provide support care and rehabilitation systems that include flexibility and offer multiple options for GBV and TIP survivors depending on their situations and needs

POLICY AND PROSECUTION

- Network with police to ensure protection of witnesses and effective prosecution of perpetrators to create a strong deterrent to the crime
- Provide intensive training for law enforcement, prosecutors, judges, social workers/psychologists, NGO staff and all others who work with survivors to develop respect for them and a need-based/case management support system
- Provide orientations for journalists on how to effectively report on TIP and for police on how to assist victims
- Support the development of new laws and national plans of action that use empowering terminology for women and girls (“single women” and “single

women with children” instead of “destitute/vulnerable/divorced/windowed women”) and insist on the rights of men and women to be informed and empowered to migrate safely

V. References

- Lom, Petr (Reporter and Producer). (2004). *The Kidnapped Bride*, *Frontline/World*. Boston, MA: PBS.
- Mauney, R.& Srun, R. (2012). *Assessment of Shelter versus Community Based Services Report: Winrock International Trafficking in Persons Program (CTIP II), Cambodia*. Manuscript in preparation.
- Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights. (2000a). *Domestic Violence in Moldova*. Retrieved from http://www.theadvocatesforhumanrights.org/uploads/moldovareport_10-11-2002.pdf
- Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights. (2000b). *Trafficking in Women: Moldova and Ukraine*. Retrieved from <http://www.theadvocatesforhumanrights.org/uploads/traffickingreport.pdf>
- Rudd, Jane, Ph.D. (2001). *A Report on Trafficking Prevention Efforts in Ukraine: Impact of the Women for Women Centers on at-Risk Teen and Adult Women*. Winrock International. Retrieved from http://www.winrock.org/leadership/files/ld_traffic_report_ukraine.pdf
- United Nations Development Programme [UNDP]. (2011). *Violence Against Women in the Family in the Republic of Moldova*. Retrieved from <http://undp.md>
- United Nations Children’s Fund [UNICEF].(2008). *The Impacts of Migration on Children in Moldova*[working paper]. Retrieved from [http://www.unicef.org/The_Impacts_of_Migration_on_Children_in_Moldova\(1\).pdf](http://www.unicef.org/The_Impacts_of_Migration_on_Children_in_Moldova(1).pdf)
- United States Agency for International Development [USAID]. (2007). *Examining the Intersection Between Trafficking in Persons and Domestic Violence*. Retrieved from http://transition.usaid.gov/our_work/democracy_and_governance/technical_areas/trafficking/pubs/dv_tip_study_072307.pdf
- Winrock International. (2001). *Nationwide Survey: “Trafficking in Women as a Social Problem in Ukrainian Society” SUMMARY OF FINDINGS*. Retrieved from <http://www.winrock.org/leadership/files/SocialMonitoring.pdf>
- Winrock International. (2003). *Trafficking Prevention Project in Ukraine*. Kiev, Ukraine.

Winrock International. (2008a). *Anti-Trafficking Initiative in Moldova: New Perspectives for Women. Final Report*. Chisinau, Moldova.

Winrock International. (2008b). *Anti-Trafficking Initiative in Moldova: New Perspectives for Women. Third Quarterly Progress Report for 2008*. Chisinau, Moldova.

Winrock International. (2008c). *Pesquisa Sobre Tráfico de Crianças e Adolescentes para Fins de Exploração Sexual no Estado da Bahia: Relatório Final [Research on Trafficking in Children and Teens for Purposes of Sexual Exploitation in the State of Bahia: Final Report]*. Bahia, Brazil.

Winrock International. (2010). *Russia Far East (RFE) Referral Project: Final Report*. Khabarovsk, Russia.

Winrock International. (2010, December). Nargis: Sold by her husband, rescued by her mother. *Trafficking in Perspective [Quarterly project newsletter]*, Volume 6. Retrieved from <http://actbd.org/index.html>

Winrock International. (2011a). *Combating Abuse and Trafficking of Children (CATCH) in Bahia: Project Progress Report, Year 3*. Bahia, Brazil.

Winrock International. (2011b). *Summer School of Leadership for Young Rural Women from both Banks of Dniester/Nistru – Empowering Women to Prevent Trafficking, Domestic Violence and Discrimination: Final Report*. Chisinau, Moldova.

Winrock International. (2012). *Semi-annual report: Actions for Combating Trafficking-in-Persons (ACT) Program. October 1, 2011 through March 31, 2012*. Dhaka, Bangladesh.

The World Bank. (2011). *Migration and Remittances Factbook2011: Second Edition*. DOI: 10.1596/978-0-8213-8218-9